



United States Department of the Interior

FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE



Post Office Box 1306
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87103

In Reply Refer To:
FWS/R2/ES/FOIA
FWS-2019-00102

Mr. Jimmy Tobias
MuckRock News
DEPT MR 61943
411A Highland Avenue
Somerville, Massachusetts 02144-2516

Dear Mr. Tobias:

This responds to your Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request dated October 2, 2018, in which you seek the following:

“Any and all guidances or memos received by Region 2 in September 2018 that pertain to Fish and Wildlife Service administrative records keeping and/or compliance with the Freedom of Information Act.”

Your FOIA request was assigned tracking number FWS-2019-00102 and forwarded to the Division of Ecological Services in the Southwest Regional Office for processing. Staff located 16 records responsive to your request. Three of these records are partially withheld (redacted) pursuant to FOIA Exemptions (b)(5), as described below. Copies of the remaining records are released to you in full with this letter.

Exemption 5 allows an agency to withhold “inter-agency or intra-agency memorandums or letters which would not be available by law to a party... in litigation with the agency.” (5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5)). Exemption 5 therefore incorporates the privileges that protect materials from discovery in litigation, including the deliberative process, attorney work-product, attorney-client, and commercial information privileges.

We are withholding three documents in part in accordance with the attorney-client privilege of Exemption 5. The attorney-client privilege protects confidential communications between an attorney and his client relating to a legal matter for which the client has sought professional advice and is not limited to the context of litigation. Moreover, although it fundamentally

applies to confidential facts divulged by a client to his/her attorney, this privilege also encompasses any opinions given by an attorney to his/her client based upon, and thus reflecting, those facts, as well as communications between attorneys that reflect confidential client-supplied information.

The information that has been withheld under the attorney-client privilege of Exemption 5 constitutes confidential communications between Federal attorneys and agency clients, related to legal matters for which the client sought professional legal assistance and services. It also encompasses opinions given by attorneys to their clients based on client-supplied facts. Additionally, the Federal employees who communicated with the attorneys regarding this information were clients of the attorneys at the time the information was generated and the attorneys were acting in their capacities as lawyers at the time they communicated legal advice. Finally, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Service) has held this information confidential and has not waived the attorney-client privilege.

The deliberative process privilege protects the decision-making process of government agencies and encourages the frank exchange of ideas on legal or policy matters by ensuring agencies are not forced to operate in a fish bowl. A number of policy purposes have been attributed to the deliberative process privilege. Among the most important are to: (1) assure that subordinates will feel free to provide the decision maker with their uninhibited opinions and recommendations; (2) protect against premature disclosure of proposed policies; and (3) protect against confusing the issues and misleading the public.

The deliberative process privilege protects materials that are both predecisional and deliberative. The privilege covers records that reflect the give-and-take of the consultative process and may include recommendations, draft documents, proposals, suggestions, and other subjective documents which reflect the personal opinions of the writer rather than the policy of the agency.

The three records withheld in part under the deliberative process privilege of Exemption 5 are both predecisional and deliberative. They do not contain or represent formal or informal agency policies or decisions. They are the result of frank and open discussions among employees of the Department of the Interior. Their contents have been held confidential by all parties and public dissemination of these drafts would have a chilling effect on the agency's deliberative processes; expose the agency's decision-making process in such a way as to discourage candid discussion within the agency, and thereby undermine its ability to perform its mandated functions.

This response to your FOIA request was made in consultation with Larry Mellinger, Attorney-Advisor, Office of the Solicitor, U.S. Department of the Interior (Department). You may appeal this response to the Department's FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer. If you choose to appeal, the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer must receive your FOIA appeal no later than 90 workdays from the date of this letter. Appeals arriving or delivered after 5 p.m. Eastern Time, Monday through Friday, will be deemed received on the next workday.

Your appeal must be made in writing. You may submit your appeal and accompanying materials to the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer by mail, courier service, fax, or email. All communications concerning your appeal should be clearly marked with the words: "FREEDOM

OF INFORMATION APPEAL." You must include an explanation of why you believe the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's (Service) response is in error. You must also include with your appeal copies of all correspondence between you and the Service concerning your FOIA request, including your original FOIA request and the Service's response. Failure to include with your appeal all correspondence between you and the Service will result in the Department's rejection of your appeal, unless the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer determines (in the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer's sole discretion) that good cause exists to accept the defective appeal.

Please include your name and daytime telephone number (or the name and telephone number of an appropriate contact), email address and fax number (if available) in case the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer needs additional information or clarification of your appeal.

DOI FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Office
Department of the Interior, Office of the Solicitor
1849 C Street, N.W.
MS-6556 MIB
Washington, D.C. 20240
Telephone: 202-208-5339/Fax: 202-208-6677
Email: FOIA.Appeals@sol.doi.gov

Also, please note the 2007 FOIA amendments created the Office of Government Information Services (OGIS) to offer mediation services to resolve disputes between FOIA requesters and Federal agencies as a non-exclusive alternative to litigation. Using OGIS services does not affect your right to pursue litigation and does not affect the timing of filing an appeal with the Department's FOIA & Privacy Act Appeals Officer. You may contact OGIS in any of the following ways:

Office of Government Information Services
National Archives and Records Administration
8601 Adelphi Road - OGIS
College Park, MD 20740-6001
E-mail: ogis@nara.gov, Web: <https://ogis.archives.gov>
Telephone: 202-741-5770 / Fax: 202-741-5769 / Toll-free: 1-877-684-6448

You also may seek dispute resolution services from our FOIA Public Liaison, Cathy Willis at 720-425-5173 or via email at cathy_willis@fws.gov.

For your information, Congress excluded three discrete categories of law enforcement and national security records from the requirements of the FOIA. See 5 U.S.C. § 552(c) (2006 & Supp. IV (2010)). This response is limited to those records that are subject to the requirements of the FOIA. This is a standard notification that is given to all our requesters and should not be taken as an indication that excluded records do, or do not, exist.

This completes the Southwest Region's response. The fees incurred in responding to your request have been waived in accordance with 43 C.F.R. §2.37. If you have any questions or

concerns regarding this request, please contact Government Information Specialist, David Tischer, at 505-248-6658 or by email at fw2foia@fws.gov.

Sincerely,

Region 2 FOIA Coordinator